



# INEE

Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies  
Réseau Inter-Agences pour l'Éducation en Situations d'Urgence  
La Red Interagencial para la Educación en Situaciones de Emergencia  
Rede Inter-Institucional para a Educação em Situação de Emergência  
الشبكة المشتركة لوكالات التعليم في حالات الطوارئ

**INEE Policy Roundtable 2010**  
15–16 November

## Framing Paper 1

**Education and Opportunity:  
Post-Primary and Income Growth**



AN ENABLING RIGHT:  
**EDUCATION  
FOR YOUTH  
AFFECTED BY CRISIS**

**2010** INEE POLICY  
ROUNDTABLE

Framing Paper 1

# Education and Opportunity: Post-Primary and Income Growth

Joshua Chaffin



AN ENABLING RIGHT:  
**EDUCATION  
FOR YOUTH**  
AFFECTED BY CRISIS

---

**2010** INEE POLICY  
ROUNDTABLE

---

## Executive Summary

This paper considers the connections between post-primary education (PPE) for crisis-affected youth, and Income Growth interventions. This complex and poorly-understood ‘gray area’ of emergencies and development work is of increasing interest in resource-poor contexts with youth-majority populations. Given that PPE is seen to have largely failed in reaching adolescent girls and boys and youth in the developing world,<sup>1</sup> and given that current thinking on development issues is going through a shift toward labor-market-centered approaches,<sup>2</sup> this paper reviews the current state of thought in the field, defines a number of often-confused terms, and seeks to better define the niche in Income Growth work for the education sector.

Employment and self-employment must become central to the mission of schools and non-formal education programmes. Tackling the livelihood needs of crisis-affected adolescents and youth will require governments, donors, and implementing agencies to create “seamless pathways”<sup>3</sup> through the worlds of school and work. This means a focus on the school-to-work transition (perhaps better termed “school-*and*-work”) throughout the education sector as a whole, perhaps in a dual-track system rather than on discrete sub-sectors such as primary, secondary, or vocational education. These actions must follow comprehensive supportive strategies through which donor and government funding are aligned to strengthen post-basic learning systems. It will require scaling up targeted approaches for adolescent girls and young women in particular, including non-formal and “modular” approaches, adopting new policies that address the reality of the burgeoning informal sector and the needs of micro- and small enterprises.<sup>4</sup> The new emphasis on continuity along the educational spectrum will require sector actors to overcome a “cultural” division between different types of agencies, and for social partners in the INGO world to engage in areas they have traditionally resisted, not least in engaging the private sector.

---

<sup>1</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

<sup>2</sup> ILO Geneva, *Conclusions on Skills for Improved Productivity, Employment Growth and Development*, International Labour Conference 2008

<sup>3</sup> ILO Geneva, *Conclusions on Skills for Improved Productivity, Employment Growth and Development*, International Labour Conference 2008

<sup>4</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

## Contents

Executive Summary .....	1
Acronyms .....	3
Acknowledgements .....	3
Introduction .....	4
Methodology.....	4
Terms and definitions .....	4
Context.....	6
Rationale .....	9
Returns to Income Growth Programmes for Crisis-Affected Youth .....	11
Approaches to Income Growth through Education Systems .....	12
TVSD .....	13
Entrepreneurship Education .....	15
Youth Financial Services .....	16
Challenges to Taking Income Growth Programming for Crisis-Affected Youth to Scale .....	17
Lessons learned.....	19
Recommendations .....	20
Pillar 1: Broadening opportunities.....	20
Pillar 2: Increasing capabilities .....	21
Pillar 3: Providing a second chance.....	23
Questions for Future Research .....	24
Annex 1: Case Study Rwanda Demobilisation and Reintegration Commission, Kigali.....	25
Further Reading .....	26

## Acronyms

ES	Economic Strengthening
DDR	Disarmament, demobilization and reintegration
GBV	Gender-based violence
LMI	Labor market information
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
NFE	Non-formal education
PPE	Post-primary education
PBET	Post-basic education and training
TVET	Technical and vocational education and training
TVSD	Technical and vocational skills development

## Acknowledgements

Thanks to the following individuals for their valuable input:

Abimbola Onigbanjo-Williams, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health  
Alice Farmer, Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre/Norwegian Refugee Committee  
Carl Triplehorn, Independent consultant  
Dale Buscher, Women's Refugee Commission  
David James-Wilson, Educational Development Center, Inc.  
David Sturza, EcoVentures International  
Else Engel, European Master in Children's Rights Graduate  
Jason Wolfe, Office of Transition Initiatives, USAID  
Jenny Perleman-Robinson, Women's Refugee Commission  
Brittney Bailey, Women's Refugee Commission  
Juliet Young, Education Section, UNICEF Somalia  
Julito C. Aligaen, Southeast Asian Ministers of Education Organization  
Kenneth King, Center for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, Scotland  
Kudzai Takavarasha, Poverty Action Lab, MIT  
Lloyd McCormick, ChildFund International  
Martha Hewison, Save the Children-UK, Tanzania  
Mendy Marsh, UNICEF-HQ  
Mera Thompson, Save the Children-UK, Somalia  
Naseem Awl, UNICEF-HQ  
Radha Rajkotia, International Rescue Committee-HQ  
Robin Shawyer, Windle Trust International  
Sarah Karmin, UNICEF-HQ  
Timothy Brown, UNESCO-Liberia  
Todd Flower, MercyCorps-Ethiopia  
Tricia Gonwa, Innovations for Poverty Action-Liberia

Special thanks to Malvern Chikanya, Independent Consultant (Rwanda), and Stephen Mwenda Gichohi of Youth Alive! (Kenya), for their field assistance.

*Photo credit: Njombo, 17, at a carpentry vocational training centre, Nianguenzi, Democratic Republic of Congo. Amadou Mbodj, Save the Children.*

## Introduction

This paper is focused on crisis and post-crisis settings in resource-poor contexts with sizeable youth minority or youth-majority populations, where large numbers of potential learners are out-of-school. In these contexts a large sub-category of learners will be unable or unwilling to fit into a traditional classroom setting, even in non-crisis times. However, even within a given country or district the category of crisis-affected youth is not a homogenous group, and it is extraordinarily difficult to generalize across contexts.

## Methodology

This paper is based on a desk review of recent research, interviews with approximately 20 expert informants from the donor, UN and INGO community, input from crisis-affected youth, and online feedback by INEE Reference Group members. The participation of young people was incorporated by way of focus group discussions held with female and male youth in September 2010. Discussions in Kigali, Rwanda included mostly youth formerly associated with fighting forces that were active in Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), who had all received skills training by the Rwanda Demobilization and Reintegration Commission in 2008. Discussions were also held in two locations in Kenya: in Rift Valley Province, with Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) and youths displaced during the post-election violence of 2008; and in Dadaab, with mostly Somali refugee youths. A youth co-author with substantial emergencies experience was commissioned to assist in collecting the anecdotal information.

## Terms and definitions

Like many other areas of humanitarian and development work, this one is plagued with definitional confusion. Little consensus has been reached on the conventions of terminology, and different actors use various terms interchangeably with different understandings of the meanings.

This paper uses the term *economic strengthening (ES)* to refer to the interventions in the three categories described by The Academy for Educational Development (AED): Social Assistance, Asset Growth and Protection, and Income Growth.<sup>5</sup> Education actors have the greatest role to play in the latter category, which includes: skills training, income-generating activities, job creation, market linkages, and business loans. The role of education actors in Income Growth interventions will be the focus of this paper.

Income Growth is elsewhere referred to by many names, including *economic empowerment*, *livelihoods development*, *workforce development*, *employment development*, *jobs development*, and *income support*. Each of those terms will have a more general or more specific meaning depending on the user and the context, but each is also used colloquially to refer in general to the field of work focused on helping people increase their incomes and make them more secure.

---

<sup>5</sup> AED, *Economic Strengthening for Vulnerable Children and Youth*, 2008

*Livelihood* is another problematic term. The INEE Minimum Standards Handbook defines it as:

*“the capabilities, assets, opportunities and activities required for a means of living. Assets include financial, natural, physical, social and human resources. Examples include stores, land and access to markets or transport systems.”*

In practice, many in the humanitarian and development field use the word *livelihoods* as shorthand to refer to the *livelihoods approach* (or the *sustainable livelihoods approach*). The sustainable livelihoods approach is a holistic package of activities that includes some form of support to greater income, but which is usually based in an attempt to achieve better outcomes in public health, behaviour change, or building social capital. The sustainable livelihoods approach emerged from the recognition by social service providers that their programmes are more successful when linked to Income Growth interventions. This is because many potential beneficiaries cannot afford the opportunity cost of participation in programmes unless there is an immediate economic benefit.<sup>6</sup>

Even though they are involved in Income Growth activities through a sustainable livelihood approach, many NGOs and international agencies are reluctant to be involved in technical and vocational education and training (TVET) in trades such as welding or carpentry.<sup>7</sup> Thus they tend to use *livelihoods* to refer to training in fields of lower-skilled, especially informal types of work.

*“...what we call “livelihoods training” is the skills training usually offered as part of women’s empowerment programs by NGOs in South Asia, usually less intensive and less formal, and focusing on what used to be called the cottage industries: sewing, knitting, vegetable growing, silkworm cultivation, and so on.”*

--Co-author of a recent literature review, via email

The line between this definition of *livelihoods* and Technical and Vocational Skills Development (TVSD) tends to blur, though, when traditional TVET is offered in conjunction with life skills or HIV interventions, as is now emerging as an international best practice. Does this combination of approaches constitute *livelihoods* work, even though it may include formal employment? In any case, the term *livelihood*, as used below, is meant only in the dictionary sense, as in the “means of support, subsistence”.<sup>8</sup>

*Post-primary education* (PPE) is here defined as encompassing forms of education beyond the primary level: secondary school and non-formal education in its many forms, not including higher education as defined in the West to mean college or university.

*Post-basic education and training* (PBET) will include formal secondary school, non-formal education in its many forms, technical and vocational education and training (TVET), and training in the “soft skills” or employability skills.

*Technical and Vocational Skills Development* (TVSD) captures both the older category of technical and vocational education and training (TVET) and, like the term post-basic education and training (PBET), the newer category of soft skills for employability.

---

<sup>6</sup> USAID, *Youth Livelihoods Development Program Guide*, 2008

<sup>7</sup> There are many exceptions to this statement, especially in the context of disarmament, demobilization and reintegration (DDR), where NGOs have often conducted TVET. For more on the “cultural” divide between actors in the field, see below, *Challenges to Taking Economic Strengthening to Scale*.

<sup>8</sup> [www.dictionary.com](http://www.dictionary.com)



*Non-formal education* (NFE) is defined by INEE as educational activities that do not correspond to the definition of formal education. Non-formal education takes place both within and outside educational institutions and caters to people of all ages. It does not always lead to certification. Non-formal education programmes are characterized by their variety, flexibility and ability to respond quickly to new educational needs of children or adults. They are often designed for specific groups of learners such as those who are too old for their grade level, those who do not attend formal school, or adults. Curricula may be based on formal education or on new approaches. Examples include accelerated 'catch-up' learning, after-school programmes, literacy and numeracy. Non-formal education may lead to late entry into formal education programmes. This is sometimes called 'second-chance education'.

*Soft skills* are job readiness skills that include effective workplace communication as well as interpersonal skills like conflict resolution, active listening, negotiation, ethical behavior, getting along with co-workers; assertiveness, and managing stress. They also include job search skills such as finding job openings, resume writing, interview skills, and networking; and financial education to help workers manage the money they earn.<sup>9</sup>

## Context

Nearly half of the world's population (almost 3 billion people) is under the age of 25.<sup>10</sup> There are over 1,220 million adolescents (10-18 years) in the world, and 88 per cent of them live in developing countries.<sup>11</sup> According to figures derived from the World Bank's World Development Indicators, (2004) some 209 million young people (15-24 years old) live on less than US\$1/day and about 515 million young people live on less than US\$2/day.

In the last two decades governments and the international community have been focused on reaching the goal of universal primary education and have found considerable success. But by all accounts, post-primary education has taken a back seat. The rate of transition to secondary school is very low, and many education systems in developing countries are characterized by low levels of learning and high levels of inequality. Millions of youth worldwide have just one or two years of secondary school, or less. In many low-income countries, only a minority of youth has been to secondary school at all,<sup>12</sup> and the education system fails to cater to the needs of those who have experienced a gap in schooling. Girls are more likely to never enter primary school than boys. In South and West Asia, only about 87 girls start primary school for every 100 boys, and in Sub-Saharan Africa, about 93 girls begin their primary education for every 100 boys.<sup>13</sup>

Adolescents and youth point to a lack of relevance of education offerings as a major cause of these low participation rates. Even those young people who have been to school are not emerging with sufficient skills, especially the high-level skills increasingly required in a modern economy. More than 20 per cent of companies in developing countries surveyed – including Algeria, Bangladesh, Brazil, China and Zambia – consider the inadequate education of workers to be a significant obstacle.<sup>14</sup> Skill mismatch, where educated youth

---

<sup>9</sup> Katz, Elizabeth/The Adolescent Girls Initiative, World Bank. *Programs Promoting Young Women's Employment: What Works?*, 2008

<sup>10</sup> UNICEF *Global Strategic Framework on Adolescent Development*, Draft, August 2010

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>12</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

<sup>13</sup> UNESCO Institute for Statistics, as cited in UN News Center, *New UN report urges push to end gender disparities in education*, 17 September 2010

<http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=35970&Cr=education&Cr1>

<sup>14</sup> World Bank, *World Development Report 2007: Development and the Next Generation*, p. 3.



acquire skills that are not demanded in the labor market, is the norm in many countries, especially in Sub-Saharan Africa.<sup>15</sup> Education and training infrastructure is particularly scarce in rural areas, and this disparity causes many to migrate to urban areas hoping for better opportunities.<sup>16</sup>

The quality and relevance of education must be improved to include skills for creative entrepreneurship. Quality non-formal education interventions are also required to increase the chances of a return to formal schooling and to provide second chances and livelihood training for those young people with additional needs. Provision of quality education should also include exploring ways to link schooling more effectively with local labour markets and providing up to date information, resources and opportunities for educational enhancement. These have included introducing life skills, soft skills, TVSD and teaching in UN languages.

Even where post-primary education has been prioritized, sector actors have usually programmed in a particular sub-silo of education, such as vocational training or tertiary education, which has meant a failure to address the needs of the education and training system “as a complex and interactive whole”.<sup>17</sup>

Many developing countries are entering a period of demographic transition, where the productive workforce forms a large proportion of the total population, with smaller proportions in the older and younger dependent groups.<sup>18</sup> According to economists and demographers, this situation offers a window for possible economic development of at least two decades. Much of the success of East Asian economies in recent years may have derived from reaping this demographic dividend, but it depends on investment in human capital at the right time.

Such investments have yet to materialize. Even before the latest global economic downturn, formal sector youth unemployment was on the rise. According to the International Labour Organization, the number of youth unemployed rose from 74 million to 85 million between 1995 and 2005, an increase of 14.8 per cent.<sup>19</sup> Part of the reason was that the youth population grew at a faster pace than economies could create jobs.

Thus in many developing countries adolescents and young adults have to take irregular casual work in the informal economy. In Sierra Leone, for example, one World Bank study found a mere nine percent of the working population in formal sector jobs.<sup>20</sup> This is often a majority-female problem. In Sub-Saharan Africa 60-80 per cent of the informally employed are women, and within the informal economy women are over-represented in the least paid and most insecure types of employment.<sup>21</sup> Young people who depend on informal employment generally have multiple livelihood strategies, which may include petty commerce on the street, and often operate on the margins of dangerous and illegal activities, from petty crime to organized crime to commercial sex.

---

<sup>15</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>16</sup> *Final Report of the Expert Group Meeting on Young People in Emergency and Transition Situations*, New York, December 2006. *Program Area Breakout Discussion Notes on Livelihoods, Food Security and Nutrition, and Water, Sanitation and Hygiene*.

<sup>17</sup> *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*. Kenneth King and Robert Palmer, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, 2006

<sup>18</sup> Paragraph based on World Bank, *World Development Report 2007: Development and the Next Generation*, 2007

<sup>19</sup> International Labour Organization, *Global Employment Trends for Youth*, ILO, Geneva, 2006

<sup>20</sup> UNICEF, *ADAP Learning Series No. 5 - Africa's Young Urbanites: Challenging Realities in a Changing Region*, 2010

<sup>21</sup> Ruth Levine et. al./Center for Global Development, *Girls Count: A Global Action & Investment Agenda*, 2009

In many crisis and post-crisis situations, more than half of the population is younger than 25 and many are younger adolescents, 10-14 years.<sup>22</sup> Even so, the needs of people in these age groups are often excluded from planning. As a result, they can become exposed to exploitation and abuse by warring factions and members of their own displaced communities. In emergency contexts, especially, some are pushed into negative coping including survival sex to support themselves and their families.<sup>23</sup>

In any emergency, adolescents and youth have their own needs: needs that are different from those of younger children and older adults,<sup>24</sup> and that are directly related to livelihood security. They may arrive in a refugee or IDP camp with other members of their communities, but soon they may face pressure to join a gang or militia, increased workload (or *decreased* workload, leading to idleness and frustration), and/or the loss of their normal means of income with few opportunities for work. Some adolescents will be thrust into the role of household head due to a death, illness or separation from their parents. The social dislocations and increased violence in crisis and post-crisis situations tend to have a disproportionate effect on women and girls,<sup>25</sup> Lacking in livelihood options in a refugee or IDP setting, displaced women and girls will often rely on collection of firewood to sell, which puts them at risk of numerous protection concerns including GBV.<sup>26</sup> They may be forced to rely on survival sex.<sup>27</sup> When a family's livelihood is threatened, young girls in some contexts are more likely to be married off to much older men in exchange for a bride-price payment.<sup>28</sup>

In the early recovery phase after a crisis, training usually targets vulnerable groups who have inadequate skills to benefit from employment opportunities emerging in the post-crisis setting. This type of training addresses the immediate needs of humanitarian and development agencies, usually in the areas of construction, transportation, education, health and security.

Education has been established as a core service in emergencies and post-conflict, but mostly at the primary level. Youth 15-24 are usually left out.<sup>29</sup> International agency priorities in the last two decades have focused largely on primary education.<sup>30</sup> Even in the recent Haiti disaster, an Education Cluster Coordinator complained that agencies had no funding for PPE “at all”, and that “hardly anybody” was engaged in economic strengthening work, much less for youth.

The nature of modern conflict makes it extremely difficult to use conventional distinctions between the emergency (or humanitarian) phase and the reconstruction or development phase. Sub-Saharan Africa, in particular, has seen crisis situations simmer over many years and occasionally manifest in such events as the post-election violence in Kenya (2008), the xenophobic attacks against non-nationals in South Africa (2008), and the leadership crisis in Madagascar (2009). Consequently, education—generally viewed as a development activity—

---

<sup>22</sup> UNICEF *Global Strategic Framework on Adolescent Development*, Draft, August 2010

<sup>23</sup> Brun, Delphine/UNICEF-DRC. *Gender Mainstreaming in Emergencies Pilot Project, Final Workplan*, 2008

<sup>24</sup> Paragraph draws from Sommers, Marc/Save the Children Federation, Inc. *Youth: Care & Protection in Emergencies, A Field Guide*, 2001

<sup>25</sup> *United Nations Policy for Post-Conflict Employment Creation, Income Generation and Reintegration*, 2009

<sup>26</sup> *UNHCR Handbook for the Protection of Women and Girls*, 2006

<sup>27</sup> *UNHCR Handbook for the Protection of Women and Girls*, 2006

<sup>28</sup> *UNHCR Handbook for the Protection of Women and Girls*, 2006

<sup>29</sup> Radha Rajkotia, International Rescue Committee, interviewed in UNICEF Podcast *International Year of Youth: Supporting young people through education*, August 2010

<sup>30</sup> *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*. Kenneth King and Robert Palmer, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, 2006

should not be excluded from emergency budgets, research and programs. In fact, education programming should avoid a sharp distinction between the emergency and reconstruction phases, so as to minimize the disruption to students and facilitate the stabilization of their daily routines<sup>31</sup>

## Rationale

*Human rights:* The effort to more closely align education and livelihood skills is closely linked to issues of human rights. The *right to education* is a primary motivator of many actors in the education sector, but while the education rights are most often thought of in relation to children, in fact education rights continue into adulthood.

Economic productivity is an important factor in the enjoyment the *right to an adequate standard of living*.<sup>32</sup> Economic strengthening has a strong link to the *right to be heard*, as well; adolescents and youth consistently tell researchers that economic dimensions are crucial to their overall development, social status, self-esteem and identity.<sup>33</sup> Even in the focus group discussions conducted for this paper, facilitators observed,

*“[They say] the [educational] system in Kenya doesn’t cater to their needs in terms of skills building for meaningful employment, whether formal or informal. They feel the system...offers them skills to communicate, [but not to] engage in income-generating activities. They speak of the need for more technical classes like welding, carpentry and building, and managing small business...to focus on activities and trainings that make the youth more self-reliant.”<sup>34</sup>*

*Positive adolescent development:* Livelihood security has been described as the key driver of positive youth development outcomes,<sup>35</sup> “the bedrock of their future wellbeing.”<sup>36</sup> Acquisition of skills for work is strongly correlated with positive behaviors and attitudes in leadership, health, valuing of diversity, success in school, and reductions in risky behaviors such as substance abuse, violence, and premature sex.<sup>37</sup> Support to Income Growth programming lies at the core of a positive adolescent development approach.

### Relevant treaties

Article 28 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC):

*“Encourage the development of different forms of secondary education, including general and vocational education, make them available and accessible to every child and take appropriate measures such as the introduction of free education and offering financial assistance in case of need;*

*Make higher education accessible to all on the basis of capacity by every appropriate means;*

*Make educational and vocational information and guidance available and accessible to all children.*

<sup>31</sup> Rahim, Aly and Peter Holland/WorldBank, *Facilitating Transitions for Children and Youth: Lessons from Four Post-Conflict Fund Projects*, 2006

<sup>32</sup> UNICEF *Global Strategic Framework on Adolescent Development*, Working Draft, November 2009

<sup>33</sup> UNICEF ESARO, *Working with Adolescents in Situations of Civil Unrest, Population Displacement, and Post-crisis Transition*, 2010

<sup>34</sup> Email correspondence with Stephen Mwenda Gichohi of Youth Alive! Kenya

<sup>35</sup> USAID/EQUIP3. *Youth Livelihoods Development Program Guide*, 2008.

<sup>36</sup> Population Council, Inc. and the International Center for Research on Women. *Adolescent Girls’ Livelihoods: Essential Questions, Essential Tools*, 2000

<sup>37</sup> USAID/EQUIP3. *Youth Livelihoods Development Program Guide*, 2008

**Risk reduction:** Without opportunities to learn and work, young people are left idle, frustrated and are much more likely to be involved in dangerous activities that put themselves and their communities at risk.<sup>38</sup> The vast majority of young people do not participate in crime and violence, but their desperation can result in social fracture, political protest, susceptibility to fundamentalism and crime. At the extreme, such as in West and Central Africa in the 1990's, a critical mass of marginalized adolescents and youth contributed to state collapse. While some in the youth development field caution against the justification of Income Growth as a means to keeping the peace, making TVSD part of the basic approach to recovery from crisis can serve as a considerable peace dividend, particularly in the case of DDR.<sup>39</sup>

**International momentum:** The Commission for Africa, the Millennium Project, the World Bank, and DFID, among others, have all in recent years called for a holistic, integrated inter-sectoral approach to education that includes TVSD.<sup>40</sup> TVSD is now seen as “a requirement to increase productivity and sustain growth.”<sup>41</sup> National competitiveness depends on the knowledge and skills of its citizens, and in high-value-added sectors these skills are acquired at the post-basic level. The 2009 ILO Global Jobs Pact calls on national governments to implement a package of macroeconomic interventions, youth-focused policies, prolonging education stays, facilitating school-to-work transitions, supporting employment prospects of ‘inactive’ youth, and boosting labour demand and job quality.<sup>42</sup>

Despite the current global economic storm, there is no better time than the present to invest in developing the skills of adolescents and the job opportunities for young people.

#### Relevant Treaties

General Comment No. 13 by the UN Committee on Economical, Social and Cultural Rights:

*...secondary education demands flexible curricula and varied delivery systems to respond to the needs of students in different social and cultural settings. The Committee encourages “alternative” educational programmes which parallel regular secondary school systems.*

*Technical and vocational education (TVE) forms part of both the right to education and the right to work (art. 6 (2)). Article 13 (2) (b) presents TVE as part of secondary education, reflecting the particular importance of TVE at this level of education. Article 6 (2), however, does not refer to TVE in relation to a specific level of education; it comprehends that TVE has a wider role, helping “to achieve steady economic, social and cultural development and full and productive employment”. Also, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that E/C.12/1999/10 page 5 “[t]echnical and professional education shall be made generally available” (art. 26 (1)). Accordingly, the Committee takes the view that TVE forms an integral element of all levels of education.*

*An introduction to technology and to the world of work should not be confined to specific TVE programmes but should be understood as a component of general education. According to the UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (1989), TVE consists of “all forms and levels of the educational process involving, in addition to general knowledge, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, know-how, attitudes and understanding relating to occupations in the various sectors of economic and social life”.*

<sup>38</sup> Women's Refugee Commission and UNICEF, Technical Notes: Special Considerations for Skills Training Programming for Adolescents and Young People, draft, 2008

<sup>39</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007

<sup>40</sup> NORRAG, *NORRAG News 38: Policy Brief: Technical and Vocational Skills Development*, 2008

<sup>41</sup> King, Kenneth, *Education, skills, sustainability and growth: Complex relations*, International Journal of Educational Development, 2008

<sup>42</sup> [http://www.oit.org/global/About\\_the\\_ILO/Media\\_and\\_public\\_information/Press\\_releases/lang--en/WCMS\\_108482/index.htm](http://www.oit.org/global/About_the_ILO/Media_and_public_information/Press_releases/lang--en/WCMS_108482/index.htm)

Policymakers are increasingly recommending that spending on human infrastructure—especially on female adolescents and youth—should surge during an economic crisis.<sup>43</sup>

While governments have much work to do in enacting enabling macroeconomic policies and removing the barriers to starting and doing business, the education sector bears a heavy burden in the effort to deliver economic growth. Schools and NFE programmes must do more to make employment and self-employment core to their mission. While the debate over the “vocationalization” of formal school is one that rages even in the richest countries, in resource-poor crisis and post-crisis contexts, the mainstreaming of job skills during late primary and post-basic is a means to ensuring greater livelihood security, especially among the most vulnerable groups.

This effort is also about systems-building for the future. A crisis context holds considerable potential for transforming educational systems and for introducing new programmes that create sustainable pathways away from aid dependency and toward wealth creation.<sup>44</sup>

*The MDGs:* Youth employment rates are one of the main indicators of progress toward poverty reduction, the first Millennium Development Goal. Future economic development depends upon properly harnessing the energy and skills of today’s adolescents and youth. All too many young people fail to find adequate employment that can provide them with a safe foothold above the poverty trap – and the prospects of such security have worsened amid the current global economic crisis.

*Government demand:* Perhaps not surprisingly, then, during this period of demographic transition and global economic downturn, governments are showing growing enthusiasm for economic strengthening programmes. Even where they are yet to allocate substantial resources to proper TVET, more and more they are including sustainable development as a theme of national school curricula, including issues of financial literacy for pursuing individual and household economic goals.<sup>45</sup>

## Returns to Income Growth Programmes for Crisis-Affected Youth

Worldwide, based on a 2007 World Bank survey of more than 200 programmes, in terms of economic cost, (defined by the labor market impact and cost-effectiveness), only about 44 per cent of interventions to support young workers were deemed successful.<sup>46</sup> There are many good reasons to believe, however, that Income Growth programming has other important real or potentially positive effects.

*Protection:* Economic skill building not only prepares adolescents and youth for work in the future, but it also protects them from exploitative and hazardous conditions.<sup>47</sup> While younger adolescents need to be protected from harmful child labour, for older children in some

---

<sup>43</sup> Komarecki, Marina, Ronald U. Mendoza and Sheila Murthy, *When the Global Downturn hits the Youth Bulge: Challenges and Opportunities for (Female) Youth Employment and Social Advancement* (Draft), May 2010.

<sup>44</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007

<sup>45</sup> UNICEF, *Life Skills Learning and Teaching: Principles, Concepts and Standards*, 2010

<sup>46</sup> Betcherman, Gordon, Et. Al., *A Review of Interventions to Support Young Workers*, World Bank, 2007. When the calculations were restricted to programs with net impact evaluations, the estimated success rate was even lower, at 33 per cent.

<sup>47</sup> UNICEF, “*The Role of Social Support and Economic Skill Building Programs in Mitigating Adolescents’ Vulnerabilities: Perspectives and UNICEF’s Experience to Date*”, 2002

contexts, and certainly for older youth, their engagement in economic work is itself a protective factor.<sup>48</sup> For female youth, especially, and especially in an emergency context, earning their own money protects them from reliance on exploitative relationships including sex for food or essential services. With all their evident advantages, however, Income Growth programs must be designed and conducted in such a way as to prevent inadvertently exposing women and girls to increased risk of violence and exploitation.<sup>49</sup>

*Health:* Greater economic opportunity boosts investment in both nutrition and education outcomes,<sup>50</sup> which have well-documented positive effects in many categories of protection and well-being. Better health outcomes also have positive intergenerational impacts, as knowledge, attitudes and practices are carried on to the next generation.

*Demand for schooling.* The very existence of PPE has been recognized as a draw toward primary school. Parents and learners place a high value on the acquisition of skills that lead to training for formal employment.<sup>51</sup>

## Approaches to Income Growth through Education Systems

*Sustainable Livelihoods Approach vs. Value Chains:* INGOs and agencies generally approach the implementation of Income Growth activities as a part of one of two frameworks: the *sustainable livelihoods approach* or the *value chain approach*. As discussed above, the sustainable livelihoods approach goes beyond a focus on employment alone to highlight the importance of acquiring a basic education and identifying opportunities for work in community services aimed at poverty reduction.<sup>52</sup> Livelihoods frameworks generally include education as a basic need, as a part of human capital or assets. They also include education as a livelihood *outcome*, in the sense that one's income level determines the amount of school, NFE or training one can afford.

Value chain analysis looks at the goods and services produced (or potentially produced) in a market and works to link micro and small enterprises into global, regional and local value chains, through linkages with larger firms.<sup>53</sup> The emphasis here is on finding the places along the chain that are in need of inputs such as training and skills enhancement, access to credit, or policy change.

---

<sup>48</sup> UNICEF, “*The Role of Social Support and Economic Skill Building Programs in Mitigating Adolescents’ Vulnerabilities: Perspectives and UNICEF’s Experience to Date*”, 2002

<sup>49</sup> Women’s Refugee Commission, *Building Livelihoods: A Field Manual for Practitioners in Humanitarian Settings*, 2009

<sup>50</sup> Jensen, Robert, *Returns to Human Capital and Gender Bias*, 2010, as cited in *Empowering Young Women: What do we know about creating the girl effect?*, Nike Foundation /The Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab at MIT, 2010

<sup>51</sup> King, Kenneth and Robert Palmer, *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, 2006

<sup>52</sup> UNICEF, “*What to do when jobs are scarce: Promoting young people’s livelihoods in Timor-Leste, Papua New Guinea and Pacific Island countries*”, 2007

<sup>53</sup> Microlinks.org, *Introduction to Value Chain Development*,  
[http://www.microlinks.org/ev\\_en.php?ID=9652\\_201&ID2=DO\\_TOPIC](http://www.microlinks.org/ev_en.php?ID=9652_201&ID2=DO_TOPIC)



Within both of these frameworks, for the education sector the palette of possible youth Income Growth interventions will remain largely the same. The conventional typology of interventions is divided into formal, non-formal and informal tracks.<sup>54</sup>

Formal	Non-formal	Informal
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In-school school-to-work programs /K-12</li> <li>• Secondary technical schools</li> <li>• Technical colleges</li> <li>• Professional colleges</li> <li>• Community colleges</li> <li>• Vocational training schools</li> <li>• Secondary professional schools</li> <li>• Post-secondary non-degree colleges and institutions</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Out-of-school youth programs</li> <li>• Drop out programs/NGOs</li> <li>• Vocational training centers</li> <li>• Job placement/employment service centers</li> <li>• Centers for regular education, providing short vocational training courses</li> <li>• Poly-technical education, career orientation centers</li> <li>• General technical training and employment consultation centers</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In-plant technical vocational training schools</li> <li>• In-plant technical training by companies, organizations, or individuals and traditional craft villages</li> <li>• Cooperatives offering craft training</li> <li>• Apprenticeship training</li> </ul>

Source: Ignatowski, Clare, et. al. *Workforce Development Programming along the Educational Spectrum*, USAID, 2009.

Of course, in the contexts considered in this paper, a large percentage of learners do not have access to the formal and non-formal tracks, and where they do, funding and quality are often low.<sup>55</sup> Few livelihood or vocational programs are integrated into formal schools. Most workers will come to training for work through traditional apprenticeship training that occurs on an individual basis and is rarely linked to TVSD programs.<sup>56</sup>

## TVSD

Most youth Income Growth programming worldwide takes the form of TVET<sup>57</sup> or TVSD. Roughly 10% of secondary school learners in developing countries are attending TVSD programmes.<sup>58</sup> TVSD can be divided into three broad categories: training sponsored by governments, training through private firms, and NGO or international agency training. Most training delivered in Sub-Saharan Africa comes through private providers.<sup>59</sup> Vocational training programmes are more costly and thus less commonly implemented than basic education programs. They are also often seen as an add-on or side project of educational reconstruction, while basic education takes priority.<sup>60</sup> They are often seen by parents and

<sup>54</sup> Ignatowski, Clare, et. al./USAID, *Workforce Development Programming along the Educational Spectrum*, 2009

<sup>55</sup> Ignatowski, Clare, et. al./USAID, *Workforce Development Programming along the Educational Spectrum*, 2009

<sup>56</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007

<sup>57</sup> Betcherman, Gordon, Et. Al., *A Review of Interventions to Support Young Workers*, World Bank, 2007

<sup>58</sup> Danida, *Mapping of Technical, Vocational and Skills Development Interventions: Final Report*, 2009

<sup>59</sup> Danida, *Mapping of Technical, Vocational and Skills Development Interventions: Final Report*, 2009

<sup>60</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007



learners as somehow inferior to academic school, and in many countries TVET deserves its reputation as a form of second-class schooling.<sup>61</sup>

In general, skills training programmes suffer from a lack of relevance.<sup>62</sup> Most have been supply-driven and insensitive to market needs. The resulting disconnect between training and the labor market has been called the most significant failure of TVET in post-conflict contexts.<sup>63</sup> Nearly every major agency and INGO in the DDR field has experience with large numbers of trainees dropping out and with the over-saturation of communities with too many young people trained in the same skill.

Reforming formal skills training programmes means making them more relevant to both formal and informal sector employment,<sup>64</sup> which in various countries has included sector-wide planning processes, development of new curricula, and the creation of specialized authorities.<sup>65</sup>

While there is a growing recognition of the need for market-led, demand-driven skills training, programmes too often fail to reach the poorest and most marginalized, and a glaring gender gap persists. As few as 15 per cent of youth Income Growth programmes around the world specifically target girls or make special allowances for their participation.<sup>66</sup>

*What works in TVSD:* Research from USAID/EQUIP3 shows that the needs of learners in poor counties are best met when they gain the equivalent of a secondary school education and acquire specific technical and employability skills, while working at least part time.<sup>67</sup> Vocational training delivered in a trade school and combined with an apprenticeship has been shown to increase earnings and formal sector employment and reduce occupational sex segregation in Latin America. These programs are thought to work best when combined with work placement and when they make an effort to facilitate women's participation, such as providing a childcare stipend. Informing girls of the higher returns to training in male-dominated trades can increase girls' enrollment in higher-return vocational training courses such as construction, mechanics, driving and IT.

Education Development Center's Haitian  
Out-of-School Youth  
Livelihood Initiative (IDEJEN)

Started in 2003, this education and training program focuses on improving the life skills, literacy and numeracy of out-of-school learners. Over time, careful monitoring found that the services offered were not enough for Haitian youth, and that what young people really needed was greater income. The package of basic education and life skills was combined with market-based vocational training.

By 2009, some 13,000 out-of-school youth had been served by this programme. Graduates were exhibiting lower levels of violent behavior and an increase in self-confidence; 2,750 youth had been certified by Haiti's national vocational training institute; 1,000 had pursued further schooling; 500 had accessed internships or jobs, 150 youth had pursued further vocational training, and 75 had started to develop micro-enterprises.

Source: *Making Cents International, State of the Field in Youth Enterprise, Employment and Livelihoods Development, 2009*

<sup>61</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2010*

<sup>62</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007. This conclusion is almost always stated or implied, across the literature.

<sup>63</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007, a claim that is often repeated in the literature.

<sup>64</sup> *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*. Kenneth King and Robert Palmer, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, 2006

<sup>65</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

<sup>66</sup> Morrison, Andrew and Shwetlena Sabarwal/World Bank. *The Economic Participation of Adolescent Girls and Young Women: Why does it Matter?* 2009

<sup>67</sup> Ignatowski, Clare, et. al./USAID, *Workforce Development Programming along the Educational Spectrum*, 2009

*Fields for Training:* Any selection of skill areas for training is ideally based on local-level market assessment (preferably conducted in a participatory manner, if feasible), and any official labor market information (LMI) that may exist. Typically, however, the most appropriate targets in post-conflict economic recovery will be agriculture, fishing and construction and their support industries, the strengthening of local trade networks,<sup>68</sup> and the teaching profession. Managerial training has been identified as a major need for indigenous African firms, especially the small and medium enterprises that make up the majority of the African private sector.<sup>69</sup>

The education sector plays roles in all of these. The post-crisis period can be an opportunity to assist in the introduction of creative and value-adding income-generating activities such as high-value crops, agro-business, food processing, renewable energy technologies, ICTs, public-private partnerships, funds for skill-based self-employment, tourism and exports.<sup>70</sup> In most rural areas, agriculture provides most of the employment and self-employment opportunities,<sup>71</sup> and thus any attempt to bring schools and NFE offerings into concert with local labor demand will necessarily lean toward agricultural sector, not least in non-farm small and medium enterprises. To reach the youth demographic, policy makers and implementers should target training toward building potential in youth-specific sectors: ICT, entertainment, tourism, agribusiness and wholesale and retail trade.<sup>72</sup>

The private sector should be consulted and where possible brought in as a partner,<sup>73</sup> especially in the case of entrepreneurship education, which may be best provided by private firms, where they exist, and contracts for training should be awarded through a competitive bidding process and evaluated based on outcomes in hiring and job retention.

Alternate models for matching labor demand and training have shown some promise, namely the distribution of vouchers for private training institutes to learners in a few Latin American countries. In the Economic Empowerment of Adolescent Girls (EPAG) program in Liberia,<sup>74</sup> skills training firms are left to themselves to determine which career fields have adequate absorption potential and will be given financial rewards if they can ensure their graduates find sustained employment in the fields for which they trained.

## Entrepreneurship Education

Many young people in a resource-poor context will begin their working lives in the informal economy as micro-entrepreneurs. Thus educators can greatly increase the relevance of school and NFE programming with courses focused on building business skills. Even where learners are able to access TVSD courses, they should also have access to entrepreneurship education in recognition of their multiple livelihood strategies that may include seasonal self-employment.

---

<sup>68</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>69</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>70</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>71</sup> *United Nations Policy for Post-Conflict Employment Creation, Income Generation and Reintegration*, 2009

<sup>72</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>73</sup> SEEP Network, *Minimum Standards for Economic Recovery after Crisis*, 2009

<sup>74</sup> Funded by the Government of Denmark, the Nike Foundation and the World Bank.

**Fundacion Paraguaya's San Francisco Agricultural School, Paraguay**

This model shows that entrepreneurship education has the potential to be entirely self-sustaining. The school provides technical training for young, rural farmers (15-21) to become better agro-entrepreneurs.

Using a business education module which promotes an alternative company structure for students to generate profit in a socially positive manner, students gain technical skills to start businesses and essentially pay for their own education. The programme is said to be 100% market-driven, and 100% of students are said to be "productively engaged" engaged post-graduation.

Source: Women's Refugee Commission, Non-formal Education Programs for Youth (Draft), 24 Aug 2010

Getting entrepreneurship education integrated into school systems is often a challenging task that requires the involvement of policymakers.<sup>75</sup> Specific curricula and training tools are available to promote the skills youth need to be entrepreneurial in today's global economy, and to create a fertile ground for the development of sustainable enterprises as a viable option for income generation.

Most teachers will not be prepared—through training or experience—to teach entrepreneurship in schools, but many tools are available to support schools in developing comprehensive entrepreneurship education programs. Education sector actors should continue to test materials and increase the access program providers have to capacity building opportunities and training tools.

For guidance, lessons learned and case examples of innovative youth enterprise initiatives from around the world, see Making

Cents International (MCI), *State of the Field in Youth Enterprise, Employment and Livelihoods Development*, 2009, and previous MCI annual reports.<sup>76</sup>

## Youth Financial Services

A crucial aspect of Income Growth programming for crisis-affected youth is access to credit facilities and savings accounts. Global experience has shown that microfinance products are viable in emergency contexts.<sup>77</sup> While youth are not necessarily interested in borrowing at younger ages, the Population Council has found that savings accounts are attractive to adolescent girls, and may be valuable in ensuring better outcomes for their protection and well-being. An emerging field of practice involves connecting microfinance institutions (MFIs) and banks to the education system, to give access to financial services at the school level.

Education actors can play a role here, working with schools to introduce financial literacy earlier on. Some banks have found success offering school-based savings for young women who would otherwise be able to open a bank account only with permission from a male family member.<sup>78</sup> There may be substantial scope for more approaches that bring schools and banks together to share knowledge and increase access to financial products for youth.

<sup>75</sup> Paragraph drawn largely from *State of the Field in Youth Enterprise, Employment and Livelihoods Development*, 2009

<sup>76</sup> [http://www.makingcents.com/products\\_services/resources.php](http://www.makingcents.com/products_services/resources.php)

<sup>77</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>78</sup> Ruth Levine et. al./Center for Global Development, *Girls Count: A Global Action & Investment Agenda*, 2009

## Challenges to Taking Income Growth Programming for Crisis-Affected Youth to Scale

*Funding:* Even where the need is recognized, resources have been scarce. Funding generally comes to youth programming through a particular sector budget such as HIV/AIDS, and is rarely allocated toward youth as a cross-cutting theme. This has meant that youth-focused programming suffers from a “silo” effect, where multi-sectoral approaches would be more appropriate.

*The “cultural” problem:* A divide exists between agencies that focus on Income Growth and agencies that focus on social services such as health and protection. This divide has been described as almost “cultural”; the former category is staffed mainly by people with private sector backgrounds, while the latter category attracts more justice-oriented personalities who may be suspicious of the pursuit of profit. A sub-category of this gap concerns adolescents especially. Given that economic development actors rarely engage adolescents, and given that child-focused agencies have not typically focused on Income Growth, working adolescents rarely receive Income Growth services.<sup>79</sup>

Worldwide, there is an evident lack of experts in both education and Income Growth programming, and only a small handful of organizations which focus on both at the same time. The lack of expertise is partly a function of the newness of the field. Even as recent as 2004 or 2005, keyword searches of emergency education reports and tools rarely yield results related to livelihoods, economic strengthening, or jobs. Even in 2009, a 200-page training guide on education for emergencies in Africa published by a large international agency contained no references to livelihoods, employment, or skills training. This entire area of work is often relegated to a single bullet point, such as, “Create new income generating projects and job opportunities”.<sup>80</sup>

“Education providers all too often see their job as ending with *inputs*, with other actors responsible for *outcomes*. This is why they have a hard time thinking about opportunity costs that learners have to pay in order to attend school.”

David James-Wilson, Educational Development Center, Inc.

*“Child labor”:* Another confounding factor has been the reticence on the part of many child-focused agencies to promote approaches that could result in increased incidence of children working at ages younger than 15. This is understandable, as working may be correlated with higher drop-out rates. However, some are now calling for a more nuanced view of children's work, rejecting the term ‘child labor’ as too blunt. New evidence shows that harm can be done in the effort to protect children from work that may in fact be beneficial to them developmentally, and as a part of their household economy.<sup>81</sup> This is especially true in times of crisis. Many children above age 12 use part-time work in the informal sector to help pay for education expenses. Others work full-time during school holidays to help contribute to the cost of tuition, clothing and school supplies.

*Mandates:* Of the UN agencies, only UNESCO has a mandate to address the entire educational continuum from primary to tertiary. Unfortunately, UNESCO has a comparatively small budget and is not an implementer of projects and programmes. Many UN agencies have youth-focused programming,<sup>82</sup> some of which pertain to education, but in

<sup>79</sup> This is also related to the concern about encouraging children's work. See “Child Labor”, below.

<sup>80</sup> A typical example, this from *The Effects of Conflict on Health and Well-Being of Women and Girls in Darfur*, UNFPA/UNICEF, 2005

<sup>81</sup> Bourdillon, Michael, et. al. *A Place for Work in Children's Lives?*, Plan International, 2010

<sup>82</sup> A comprehensive list can be found here: <http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unyin/agenda.htm>

general the education sector comprises of several agencies working separately without a mandate to address youth needs holistically. UNDP often supports TVET, but mostly steers clear of the education sector. The ILO is engaged in support to TVET, mostly at the policy level. UNICEF, as a major player in emergency education, has historically avoided issues of Income Growth at the global level, though its Country Offices do often engage in Income Growth programming.

*Terms and definitions:* As discussed at length above, there is considerable definitional confusion around the many terms used in this area of work. This confounds efforts at building the evidence base, comparing approaches, securing institutional commitments and developing policies.

*Lack of evidence:* Developing monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems and formulating indicators early on are rarely priorities after a crisis, and these are often done too little or too late.<sup>83</sup> Existing evidence in support of particular approaches to Income Growth in emergencies and post-crisis is scarce. Most of what is known about Income Growth work comes from non-emergency contexts. Because of the primary-level focus of the education sector over the last two decades, there is now a “distinct lack of research for secondary and tertiary levels”.<sup>84</sup> There are few estimates of the economic returns on investments in education and learning outside the formal school setting.<sup>85</sup> With all the various approaches applied around the world, and given the number of ministries and agencies involved in any given context, data on NFE is by its very nature “extremely demanding if not impossible”<sup>86</sup> to report to statistical agencies, and designers of household surveys struggle to find the right questions to ask. “Soft skills” for employment such as teamwork and problem-solving are becoming increasingly important but are hard to quantify.<sup>87</sup> In TVSD, there is very little useful statistical data due in part to its varying length and various skill areas. Few training providers conduct tracer studies to follow participants after certification.<sup>88</sup> The Nike Foundation is piloting a number of models for girls’ Income Growth and have devoted as much as a third of their programme budgets to M&E, but this is hardly the norm. UNESCO has developed a Non-Formal Education Management Information System, but with the agency’s small footprint, the system is underutilized globally.

Data collection is increasingly disaggregated by age and gender, but this process is by no means complete. In order to improve the design of future Income Growth programs, more robust evaluation processes will be required that measures not just inputs and outputs but also impact and cost.<sup>89</sup>

*Weak regulation:* Setting standards for TVSD is an often-overlooked priority even in non-crisis contexts.<sup>90</sup> With the expanded post-conflict pool of those seeking skills and training and the need for more training firms, there is a strong need to establish standardized curricula and government recognized certification. These regulations reduce fraud and can become the foundations for a modern job education and training system down the road.

---

<sup>83</sup> *United Nations Policy for Post-Conflict Employment Creation, Income Generation and Reintegration*, 2009

<sup>84</sup> King, Kenneth and Robert Palmer, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*, 2006

<sup>85</sup> Lloyd, Cynthia B./Population Council. *New Lessons: The Power of Educating Adolescent Girls*, 2010

<sup>86</sup> King, Kenneth. *A Technical and Vocation Education and Training Strategy for UNESCO. A Background Paper*, 2009

<sup>87</sup> Danida, *Mapping of Technical, Vocational and Skills Development Interventions: Final Report*, 2009

<sup>88</sup> Danida, *Mapping of Technical, Vocational and Skills Development Interventions: Final Report*, 2009

<sup>89</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>90</sup> Paragraph adapted from *United Nations Policy for Post-Conflict Employment Creation, Income Generation and Reintegration*, 2009



## Lessons learned

*Opportunity cost:* The single greatest obstacle to any kind of Income Growth programming for marginalized youth is the time required for training—the opportunity cost of attending.<sup>91,92,93</sup> Many young people, especially girls and young women, cannot attend unless there is the perception of a near-term material benefit.<sup>94</sup>

*Holistic approaches:* The most successful youth Income Growth programs combine employment readiness, basic education, and life skills to create a holistic package.<sup>95,96,97</sup> In a post-crisis environment these should be offered in combination with psychosocial interventions.<sup>98</sup>

*Building trust:* The number one determinant of sustained program success is building trust with targeted youths.<sup>99</sup> This is especially true in post-conflict settings, where social capital will be greatly eroded and dependency syndrome may be entrenched.

*Participation:* The trust issue is closely related to issues of meaningful participation. Trust will be built by involving participants in all phases of programme design, monitoring and evaluation. This involves consulting with communities, including women and girls, community-based organizations, churches, traditional leaders, children and youth.<sup>100</sup>

*Decentralized mechanisms:* The success of TVSD in some Latin American countries has been attributed to delivery through a decentralized system of training institutes, which are given autonomy in developing and delivering course content.<sup>101</sup>

*Modular approach:*<sup>102</sup> While education sector actors tend to see the transition from school to work as an event that occurs at a point in time, perhaps a more useful model from the perspective of a crisis-affected young person in a resource-poor environment is an overlapping process of exchange between various types of education and economic activities. Parents and young people may be more likely to access education and training if they can receive it in smaller modules and on flexible schedules.

---

<sup>91</sup> Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper, UNESCO-UNEVOC 2007

<sup>92</sup> Conversation with David James-Wilson, EDC.

<sup>93</sup> World Bank, Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper, 2010

<sup>94</sup> A finding of the 2010 *Evaluation of UNICEF's Programme and Work in Relation to Adolescents and the Participation of Children and Young People*

<sup>95</sup> Women's Refugee Commission and UNICEF, *Technical Notes: Special Considerations for Skills Training Programming for Adolescents and Young People*, draft, 2008

<sup>96</sup> Betcherman, Gordon, et. al., *A Review of Interventions to Support Young Workers*, World Bank, 2007

<sup>97</sup> SEEP Network, *Minimum Standards for Economic Recovery after Crisis*, 2009

<sup>98</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007

<sup>99</sup> Blattman, Chris, Yale University & Innovations for Poverty Action, *Comments on discussion document, "Securing a Better Future for Near-Forgotten Liberian Youth" by Dr. Toga Gayewea McIntosh*, September 2010, provided to the author by IPA-Liberia

<sup>100</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC, *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries: A Discussion Paper*, 2007

<sup>101</sup> Katz, Elizabeth/The Adolescent Girls Initiative, World Bank. *Programs Promoting Young Women's Employment: What Works?*, 2008

<sup>102</sup> James-Wilson, David/Education Development Center, Inc. & EQUIP3, *Tracking the Impact of Returning to Education: Reconnecting Young People with Educational Opportunities Contributes to Peace Building in Mindanao*, 2010, and in conversation with the author.

*Positive demonstration:* The first step in breaking the cycle of poverty, unemployment and violence is to change the image of young people as a security threat – by involving them in reconstruction and community development programmes early on.

*Start with what existed before:* While in the acute phase of a crisis, earning money may be a young person's biggest concern, as soon as possible they should be supported to return to their previous educational trajectory, perhaps in conjunction with their livelihood activities.

## Recommendations

The following recommendations are grouped roughly in line with the “Three Pillars” for addressing the challenge of youth employment, offered by Garcia and Fares.<sup>103</sup> While their three pillars were concerned with policy in all sectors, these are also useful as a tool for prioritizing the policy and programme approaches of education sector actors concerned with youth Income Growth in a post-crisis environment.

1. *Broadening opportunities*
2. *Increasing capabilities*
3. *Providing a second chance*

### Pillar 1: Broadening opportunities

In general, education actors in an emergency context should engage in advocacy and support to improve the quality and relevance of the education system to better suit the emerging needs of the labour market. This means working with a wide variety of stakeholders to develop a portfolio of approaches geared toward the various segments of the learner population, ranging from literacy to TVET to managerial and entrepreneurship skills,<sup>104</sup> recognizing that most informal economy workers employ multiple livelihood strategies that may change seasonally.

One of the distinguishing features of learners at the post-primary level in resource-poor post-crisis environments is their much higher opportunity cost as compared to primary learners. By the time they finish primary school, many are already important contributors to their household economies. They and their families may still be willing to trade work time for school time, but in smaller amounts. Instead of making poor youth and their families choose between education and earning, they may be better served with “flexible, modular programming that allows them to build human and social capital and key livelihood competencies while still contributing to immediate household economic survival”.<sup>105</sup>

Special attention should be paid to reaching adolescent girls, young women and marginalized population groups. This will require specific targeting, and making the effort to “see” invisible girls who may be busy with domestic duties or culturally constrained from participating. In humanitarian settings around the world, adolescents have proven extremely effective at locating and engaging their more marginalized peers in the community for

---

<sup>103</sup> Garcia, Marito and Jean Fares, eds./World Bank, *Youth in Africa's Labor Market*, 2008

<sup>104</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

<sup>105</sup> James-Wilson, David/Education Development Center, Inc & EQUIP3. *Balancing Education and Work: An Integrated Approach to Learning Who Need to Work in Order to Stay in Education. A Presentation to the 2008 CIES Conference*, 2008



inclusion in activities. Outreach of national training institutions should be extended to rural areas, employing innovative approaches including community-based training in line with local employment opportunities, distance learning through ICTs, mobile training, and development of cooperatives.<sup>106</sup>

To establish priorities and roles for the various actors, a common entry point for this work is a government-led process to develop a comprehensive market-driven and performance-based continuing education and training framework,<sup>107</sup> with meaningful youth participation.

Another important step is the participatory development of a national youth policy,<sup>108</sup> a strong focus of which should be on the most vulnerable groups, most of whom are not in school: adolescents on the street or associated with gangs or militias; those heading households; those engaged in dangerous work; members of ethnic minorities; those living with disabilities or health impairments; and those at high risk of HIV. As governments and their constituents will often see NFE and informal approaches as somehow sub-standard, other education sector actors have an advocacy role to play in convincing them of the need for alternative arrangements.

Education actors can also help facilitate the development of a national framework for girls' education, in a process that includes private skills training firms and NGO skills training providers. NGOs and donors can help to ensure gender parity in programming through the use of gender equity language, images of women in non-traditional roles, and adoption of girl-friendly approaches.<sup>109</sup>

## Pillar 2: Increasing capabilities

The occasion of a national crisis calls for a sector-wide approach to recovery and systems reform. Governments need to plan for holistic systems of education which integrate secondary education, TVSD, and tertiary education into a coherent whole.<sup>110</sup> Employment and self-employment must become central to the mission of schools and NFE programmes. Tackling the livelihood needs of crisis-affected adolescents and youth will require governments, donors, and implementing agencies to create “seamless pathways”<sup>111</sup> through the worlds of school and work. This means the recognition that for many learners the school-to-work transition is necessarily a “school-and-work” transition. Their preparation for the world of work is a task for the education sector as a whole and will require a parallel or dual-track system. These priorities should appear in any initial post-conflict needs assessment and later in any national development strategy such as a Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP).

---

<sup>106</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

<sup>107</sup> World Bank, *Youth Employment in Africa: Discussion Paper*, 2010

<sup>108</sup> UNICEF ADAP-HQ, *Promoting Adolescent Livelihoods: A discussion paper prepared for the Commonwealth Youth Programme*

<sup>109</sup> Programmers can access a list of girl-friendly strategies on p.78 of Lloyd, Cynthia B./Population Council. *New Lessons: The Power of Educating Adolescent Girls*, 2010

<sup>110</sup> King, Kenneth and Robert Palmer, Centre for African Studies, University of Edinburgh, *Education, Training and the Enabling Environments: A Review of Research and Policy*, 2006

<sup>111</sup> ILO Geneva, *Conclusions on Skills for Improved Productivity, Employment Growth and Development*, International Labour Conference 2008

This calls for a much closer relationship between the education sector and ministries and agencies working in the economic realm, including traditional providers of TVSD. Education and training efforts must be integrated with economic policies that help create jobs and job opportunities.

Dual-track or “vocationalized” education has fallen in and out of favor over time in the developing world, having been introduced by the European colonizers and rejected by many countries around the time of independence. While it resurged in some countries in the 1980s, dual-track education was all but abandoned again in the push for universal primary education.<sup>112</sup>

It is no longer appropriate to consider general and vocational education as separate options.<sup>113</sup> Rather the two must converge in order to offer the type of education that will build the competencies needed in a globalized economy. Experience shows that for these to succeed, schools and NFE programmes must maintain strong links between practical subjects and the world of work.

One entry point for this work has been in establishing or updating the national qualifications framework. This can become a platform for dialogue between ministries, education practitioners, young women and men to make schools and skills development more relevant, and to ensure the transferability of qualifications.<sup>114</sup>

The education sector is crucial to the effort of sensitizing communities about the conditions and mechanisms behind economic growth. Many in “patronage states”, where the public sector (and more recently, the donor-funded NGO sector) has always been the major provider of formal employment, will have little knowledge of the basics of how private sector jobs are created, and may see private sector employment as somehow sub-standard. The public re-education effort should start with teachers since the role of the private sector as the engine of economic growth is often not understood by teachers themselves.<sup>115</sup>

While an abundance of life skills curricula exist, education ministries may need curriculum development assistance in expanding core skills to include household and small business

#### **ChildFund International and Junior Achievement**

Recognizing the need for education in basic concepts around the benefits of free enterprise and the mechanisms of economic growth, ChildFund International has partnered in several countries with Junior Achievement, a US-based youth organization that promotes entrepreneurship in schools around the world.

In the Gambia, the program offers two courses to at-risk youth: a money management class focused saving, investing, loans, insurance and household economic planning; and a course that helps small groups of young people start a real business.

The CFI/JA program currently reaches small numbers of young people in several African countries, but experience in the US has shown these approaches can be taken to scale. JA curricula are being adapted to NFE programmes in many country contexts.

<sup>112</sup> Lauglo, Jon and Rupert Maclean, Eds./UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training, *Vocationalisation of Secondary Education Revisited*, 2005

<sup>113</sup> Wilson, D.N., *Promise and performance in vocationalised secondary education: has the baby been thrown out with the bath water?*, 2005

<sup>114</sup> ILO Geneva, *Conclusions on Skills for Improved Productivity, Employment Growth and Development*, International Labour Conference 2008

<sup>115</sup> Conversation with a UNICEF Education Officer in East Africa

economic skills.<sup>116</sup> Education ministries and agencies may also lack the capacity to conduct market surveys, identify apprenticeship candidates, and provide job counselling.

Determining success in all categories rests on improved monitoring and evaluation. To date very little systematic and scientific evaluation of NFE programming has been undertaken, but given that demand will likely continue to increase, governments will need support to set up longer-term evaluations to identify potential areas of productive intervention, as well as potential gender specific challenges. New baseline data collection tools for collecting information on are emerging; survey instruments include the ILO's *School to Work Transition Survey* (SWTS) and the Search Institute's *Developmental Assets Profile* (DAP) tool.<sup>117</sup>

### **Pillar 3: Providing a second chance**

Second-chance approaches to education are increasingly recognized as necessary, but this remains a highly-neglected area.<sup>118</sup> Strategies in this category have included catch-up literacy and equivalency courses; accelerated learning schemes; and combinations of training in life skills, confidence building, civic education, group formation, crisis prevention, reconciliation and conflict prevention. Second-chance education should be accompanied with services such as childcare and appropriate security and sanitary facilities for girls and women, and should include job counseling, referral and other such services for first time labor market entrants.

---

<sup>116</sup> Radha Rajkotia, International Rescue Committee, interviewed in UNICEF Podcast *International Year of Youth: Supporting young people through education*, August 2010

<sup>117</sup> James-Wilson, David/Education Development Center, Inc. & EQUIP3, *Tracking the Impact of Returning to Education: Reconnecting Young People with Educational Opportunities Contributes to Peace Building in Mindanao*, 2010

<sup>118</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report*, 2010

## Questions for Future Research

- This review found many instances of scholars and practitioners lamenting the gap between actors in the fields of education and Income Growth. What steps can be taken at all levels to bring these two areas of practice closer together?
- What can be learned from experience with dual-track or parallel-track approaches to post-basic education and training in post-conflict settings?
- What works for young women vs. what works for young men? What approaches have helped young women to escape traditional gender-stereotyped professions, and what have been the effects of entering non-traditional professions?
- What approaches show the greatest potential for going to scale?
- Crisis and especially conflict can have deteriorating effects on economic relationships, especially by breaking down trust between actors along a value chain. Conflict environments often lead people to limit their trust to their immediate neighbors or extended families, which harms the overall functioning of value chains. What is the role of the education sector in restoring trust along value chains?<sup>119</sup>

---

<sup>119</sup> Email correspondence with David Sturza of EcoVentures International, 2010

## **Annex 1: Case Study Rwanda Demobilisation and Reintegration Commission, Kigali**

With World Bank funding, 500 Rwandan girls and boys who had been associated with forces fighting in DRC received a one-year, holistic intervention including tracing and family reunification, psycho-social counselling, formal school placement and NFE, follow-up monitoring in communities of return, parenting-related services for girls, and separate tracks for youth with disabilities.

While some girls took driving, mechanics, metal work, IT or electrical training with the boys, most opted for beauty and hospitality courses. All participants said they had received start-up kits from the program. Some had never been to school prior to joining the program; they were tracked into basic numeracy and literacy classes to complement their training.

One girl (of three interviewed) was working full time, while the other two worked part time in people's homes, still caring for their own children and husbands. Most youth reported being employed in the trades they were trained in: auto mechanics, welding, electrical and carpentry. Some had formed a carpentry cooperative. Generally their income increased after acquiring skills. Some bought land, built houses, and their social status had changed for the better. Others were still out of work.

Participants were only involved in planning at the stage of developing selection criteria for enrolment. Some training providers asked the youth to elect their own programme.

### **Youth feedback**

- Girls felt they were regarded as non-soldiers by programme staff.
- Girls felt a bias in training centers toward fields they were not interested in.
- One girl was discouraged by an instructor from taking mechanics, based on her sex.
- Some girls got pregnant and dropped out.
- More effort should be spent on managing expectations; new entrants should get a chance to meet with youth who have gone through similar programs.
- Youth should not be mixed with adults.
- There is a need for a follow-up coaching in small business skills.

*Source: focus group discussions in Kigali, September 2010 with 18 male and female youth aged 17-25 years.*

## Further Reading

Betcherman, Gordon, et. al., *A Review of Interventions to Support Young Workers*, World Bank, 2007

<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Labor-Market-DP/0715.pdf>

To date, the most comprehensive inventory of research on what works in youth employment programming, looking at more than 200 programs worldwide.

Bourdillon, Michael, et. al. *A Place for Work in Children's Lives?*, Plan International, 2010

<http://plancanada.ca/downloads/A%20place%20for%20work%20in%20children%27s%20lives.pdf>

This chapter from a forthcoming book discusses the benefits of children's work, the relevant international conventions, and lessons from various programme responses to harmful labor of children.

Israel, Ron / EDC & USAID, *Workforce Development Program Guide*, 2009

<http://www.equip123.net/docs/e3-programguidesworkforcedevelopment.pdf>

This brief guide contains a sequenced model for building a local or national workforce development program, including in post-crisis settings.

Making Cents International, *State of the Field in Youth Enterprise, Employment and Livelihoods Development*, 2009 (and previous annual reports).

The reports from MCI's annual conference are a major resource for guidance, lessons learned and case examples of innovative youth enterprise initiatives from around the world.

[http://www.makingcents.com/products\\_services/resources.php](http://www.makingcents.com/products_services/resources.php)

UNESCO, *Guidebook for Planning Education in Emergencies and Reconstruction*, 2006 (especially Chapter 14, Section 3: *Access and Inclusion*.)

<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001470/147092e.pdf>

This section contains a list of 12 suggested strategies for PPE in emergencies, many of which pertain to Income Growth.

Women's Refugee Commission, *Building Livelihoods: A Field Manual for Practitioners in Humanitarian Settings*, 2009

[http://womensrefugeecommission.org/reports/doc\\_download/281-building-livelihoods-a-field-manual-for-practitioners-in-humanitarian-settings](http://womensrefugeecommission.org/reports/doc_download/281-building-livelihoods-a-field-manual-for-practitioners-in-humanitarian-settings)

This comprehensive guide places special emphasis on issues of targeting and protection for women and girls.

**INEE**