

Third International Policy Dialogue Forum of the Task Force on Teachers for EFA

Understanding the Role of Teacher Policy and Programming in Fragility¹

I. Problem to be studied

How does policy and programming related to teacher quality and equity impact on education's potential to either mitigate or exacerbate conflict and fragility?²

II. Contributions of this paper

This paper applies country-level research on education and fragility to explore the influence that policies and programming related to teacher quality and equity have on fragility in PCPD contexts.

The paper draws from specific examples to provide recommendations for fragility mitigating teacher policies, with a focus on Asia and the Pacific. The paper also identifies gaps in policy knowledge for additional research.

III. Methods

This paper is based on findings from the [INEE Situational Analysis on Education and Fragility](#), carried out by the INEE Working Group on Education and Fragility. The four studies in the series— Cambodia, Liberia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and Afghanistan were conducted from 2009-2010. These four countries were selected to encompass a range of different types and stages of fragility, with diverse geographical locations and historical antecedents to such fragility. Given the instability and/or prevalence of violence in these contexts, the paper will focus on post-conflict situations while also drawing upon examples from other contexts of fragility including refugee and post-disaster situations.

This paper additionally draws upon the INEE Guidance Notes on [Teaching and Learning](#) and [Teacher Compensation](#) and on [INEE Minimum Standards Case Studies](#).

IV. Introduction


One of the objectives of the [INEE Working Group on Education and Fragility](#) is to strengthen consensus on what works to mitigate state fragility through education while ensuring equitable access and quality education for all. Accomplishing this task requires a deeper knowledge of the impacts of all aspects of education—including teacher policy—on fragile states, and education's role in both exacerbating fragility and building resilience.

In order to more fully explore the complex relationship between education and fragility, the INEE Situational Analyses of Education and Fragility employs a larger spectrum of impacts ranging between the two extremes of either exacerbating or mitigating fragility. The spectrum identifies five ways education impacts on fragility ranging from the negative, where education actively or deliberately reinforces and perpetuates fragility, to the positive, where education can make inroads into fragility. The use of this

¹ This paper was prepared for the Third International Policy Dialogue Forum of the Task Force on Teachers for EFA held in Bali, Republic of Indonesia, September 13-14 2011 by Arianna Sloat with input from Lori Heninger, Dean Brooks, Elizabeth Sweet and Kerstin Tebbe.

² Contexts of fragility are distinguished from 'non-fragile' contexts first and foremost by instability—political, economic, social—which is often coupled with the presence (or risk) of violent conflict. Fragile contexts are marked by any number or combination of dynamics of fragility including poor governance repression, corruption, inequality and exclusion and low levels of social cohesion (UNESCO 2011b).

spectrum provides insights into the outcomes of past and present policies, and potentially offers some lessons learned for future interventions.

Spectrum of Impact	Type of impact of education on fragility	Examples and Elaboration
 <p>Exacerbating Fragility</p> <p>Mitigating Fragility</p>	Education actively or deliberately reinforcing and perpetuating fragility	Education deliberately being used to reinforce or perpetuate fragility through the politicisation of structures, curriculum and textbooks; targeted exclusion and marginalisation; attacks on schools by belligerents; etc.
	Education reflecting the status quo	Education not so much designed or manipulated by key actors to create tension or foster power interests, but simply reflecting the fragile status quo by reproducing and failing to challenge existent patterns of division, inequality, violence, corruption and inefficiency.
	Education inadvertently favouring fragility	Well-intended, but inadvertently counter-productive interventions, ranging from peace agreements which further entrench social divisions and tensions, to vocational education and accelerated learning initiatives which lead to frustration among unemployed graduates.
	Education enabling people to live with fragility	Education enabling people to live and operate in the existent fragile context by softening its impact. This includes curricula enhancing capabilities in livelihoods, health and conflict resolution.
	Education making inroads into fragility	Education starting to break the cycles of fragility themselves. This includes education's effect in challenging the reproduction of inequality and division, in enhancing national unity and national hope for the future, in strengthening civil engagement and in building legitimacy of the government.

(INEE Situational Analyses of Education and Fragility: Synthesis brief)

Delineating the relationship of education to fragility along a spectrum of impact may enable targets to be established, help inform policy initiatives, and may provide greater realism about current and future possibilities. However, in order to focus on policy and programming priorities, this paper simplifies the spectrum to a 'two-faced' approach to initiatives that have had either a positive or negative effect on fragility.

While outside the scope of this paper, it is important to note that weak education systems may be both an effect and cause of fragility. This two-way relationship must be taken into account in policy and programming planning in fragile contexts. (To read more about how fragility impacts *on* education – please see the paper [“Multiple Faces of Education in Conflict-Affected and Fragile Contexts”](#).)

Paper Format:

This paper will address the following areas of teacher policy in relation to their role in either exacerbating or mitigating fragility:

- Training, Professional Development, and Support
- Teacher Recruitment, Retention and Placement
- Teacher Compensation
- Instruction and Learning Processes

The tables below each highlight one of these areas of teacher policy or programming and present related initiatives that have impacted on fragility either positively or negatively in PCPD contexts. The tables outline recommendations drawn from the highlighted examples along with gap areas in policy knowledge where additional research may be valuable.

Whether education mitigates or exacerbates conflict and fragility is a result of nuanced and context specific interfaces between education policies, planning and programming and the specific dynamics of conflict and fragility. Thus, the policy and programming recommendations listed here are not intended as a prescriptive solution or a blueprint response to issues of teacher policy and programming in fragile contexts. Instead, they should be adapted to the local context, and used as a platform for planning and implementing an appropriate response.

V. Teacher Training, Professional Development and Support

The key role of professional development during teachers' service beyond the initial stage of preparation has come to be widely acknowledged. In-service professional development is especially important in PCPD contexts in which education systems, curricular content and education policy is emerging and evolving to meet changing needs. While limitations in capacity may be less direct drivers of fragility, they can significantly amplify the effects of educational irrelevance, disparate access, community fragmentation and the conditions that foster corruption within schools.

Teacher Training, Professional Development and Support	
Example	Policy/ Programming: Lessons Learned
<p>Negative Impact on Fragility</p> <p><u>Ethnic Segregation and Language Issues</u> In Bosnia and Herzegovina teacher training is largely segregated with pedagogical institutes tailoring their programmes to the curriculum of the dominant group. The ethnic polarization within the teaching profession serves to maintain/solidify ethnic and language divisions in the education system. This process was influenced by General Framework Agreement for Peace's (GFA) decentralization of education that devolved responsibility for the development of teacher training programs to the pedagogical institutes in each mostly-ethnically homogenous canton. Ethnic segregation was further influenced by the GFA and the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which both protect language rights, and was therefore used to justify the continuation of separate schooling for Bosnian, Serbian and Croatian students. This paved the way for linguistic arguments to be used to support political motivation by those arguing for separate schooling. Thus, instead of recognizing education's potential to contribute to societal reconciliation in the aftermath of war, the GFA led to the emergence of three education systems separating the country's children along ethnic lines (Magill 2010).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Claims regarding language and religion should be taken into account, but should be managed within the broader goals of development and the need for peaceful coexistence. The overarching goal should be to promote national unity while acknowledging and respecting differences and particularities (UNESCO 2011b). • Promote adequate degrees of decentralization in combination with some central regulation, while strengthening capacity and monitoring efficiency at both the central and decentralized levels (UNESCO 2011b). • To minimise marginalization, decisions about language(s) of instruction should be made on the basis of consensus, involving the community, education authorities and other relevant stakeholders (INEE 2010b).

Positive Impact on Fragility	<p><u>In-Service Professional Development</u> An in-service professional development program led by World Relief in Southern Sudan provides progressive and participatory training, helping teachers transition from unstable contexts into the new sustainable education system, not only by increasing their skills and competence but also by helping teachers achieve government accreditation standards. In-service professional development programs allow teachers to stay current with emerging government policy and may serve as a bridge between the developing country's education system and teachers who have served outside of any "official system" (INEE 2010c).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Given financial and capacity restraints, it may be necessary to resort to short-term in-service teacher training programs and employ an incremental approach (Sigsgaard 2011). • Given Southern Sudan's vast geography, the deployment of mobile teacher training teams throughout the country have proven to be a cost-effective way to access underserved areas (INEE 2010c). • Organised education and training constitute only one, albeit vital, form of professional development. In schools that have become learning organisations, much development takes places informally with and through colleagues. Policy strategies therefore need to look more widely than sending teachers on courses (OECD 2001). • A comprehensive, tiered approach may be an effective way to improve and sustain the quality of classroom teaching. The first round of funding may focus on training teachers then the program may be expanded to management training for head teachers, local education officials and community PTAs. This tiered approach increases capacity at all levels—classroom, school, community and government—for coordinated delivery and management of education services (INEE Minimum Standards Case Study: Teacher Training-South Sudan).
Gap Areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How can the linkages between curriculum revision, teacher training and assessment of learning outcomes be strengthened to ensure there is no disconnect in emerging education systems? • Considering that research prioritizing education in one's mother tongue is considered best practice, how can education systems utilize sound teaching approaches without contributing to divisiveness? • How can public-private partnerships be utilized in PCPD contexts to improve teacher quality and professional development programs? Innovative financing approaches for education such as those outlined by the Leading Group on Innovating Financing for Development may be interesting to explore here. • There is a lack of case study examples of effective teacher training and professional development in situations of PCPD. 	

VI. Teacher Recruitment, Retention and Placement

Teacher recruitment and placement can create or exacerbate tensions if not performed in a non-discriminatory, participatory and transparent manner. Policies that ensure teacher retention are essential to assure that teacher training and professional development programs positively impact on long-term education quality.

Teacher Recruitment, Retention and Placement		
	Example	Policy/ Programming: Lessons Learned
Negative Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Corruption</u> In Cambodia, corruption may pose barriers to teachers entering the workforce. In a World Bank-supported case study, one prospective teacher bemoaned, 'I cannot find a job; I have finished high school but need to pay bribes to become a teacher. I cannot afford that' (Nissen, 2004). Corruption pervades many aspects of the education system. Students directly encounter the tension between merit and patronage. Unqualified individuals gain access, and highly qualified candidates are excluded from critical professions such as medicine, engineering, accounting, and the judiciary because entry exam results are for sale. Thus, not only does corruption undermine the education system, but the education system in turn introduces corruption to children and youths not yet even employed (UNESCO 2011a).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transparency is important for effective monitoring and accountability. Relevant information on policy planning and implementation, including practices to prevent corruption should be shared between central and local authorities, communities and other humanitarian stakeholders. There should be confidential and culturally appropriate systems for handling complaints of corruption. Systems should include policies to encourage people to report corruption and to protect those who do so (INEE 2010b).
	<p><u>Teacher Retention</u> In Sierra Leone many graduates of teacher training institutions do not enter the teaching profession, and a significant number of those who do stay for less than four years (World Bank 2007). Many students attend teacher-training colleges with no intention of working as teachers; they are simply looking for any tertiary training they can get (Shepler 2010). Thus, many trained teachers are not teaching while classrooms are staffed by untrained teachers. This example reinforces the concept that teacher training alone will not necessary improve education systems especially in fragile contexts in which for various reasons teachers may leave the profession faster that they can be trained.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The negative perception of the teaching profession could be improved by the government paying salaries on time, granting teachers loan facilities, and including more teachers in its annual national awards (World Bank 2007). • It may make sense to lobby for trained teachers who want to work rather than training new teachers. The best approach may be to work with teachers who are already working in schools, especially in rural areas, by conducting in-service training and continuing distance education programs (Shepler 2010).

	<p><u>Unequal Teacher Distribution</u> In Cambodia the unequal distribution of existing teaching capacity contributes to further social inequity, particularly among the rural and poor populations. This systemic exclusion of segments of society from access to quality education perpetuates fragility (UNESCO 2011a).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National budgets can play a vital role in equalizing educational opportunities between richer and poorer populations and regions. Redistributive public spending can help to narrow gaps. Conversely, failure to prioritize equity in national budgets can reinforce existing disparities (UNESCO 2010). • Sufficient resources should be mobilized to ensure continuity, equity and quality of education activities. National authorities, communities and humanitarian organisations have the responsibility to ensure that all people have access to educational activities. This means assessing and addressing the needs and priorities of excluded groups (INEE 2010b). • Through sensitisation and training, local communities may become increasingly involved in ensuring the rights of all children, youth and adults to quality and relevant education (INEE 2010b). This includes ensuring equitable teacher distribution.
Positive Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Rural Teacher Incentives</u> In many countries there are qualified teachers in urban areas who are unemployed, while there are unfilled posts in rural areas. This pattern of simultaneous surplus and shortage contributes to rural marginalization and may fuel resentment and inequities. There is a need for policies that will ensure that teachers reach the schools where they are needed. In Zambia, the incentive payment is calculated on a sliding scale, based on distance from the nearest tarred road. In 2001, Uganda introduced a hardship allowance of 20% of salary for 'hard-to-reach' areas. Such programs may help to redistribute quality teachers to where they are most needed (Mulkeen 2006).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incentives such as extra pay, teacher housing and other non-monetary benefits can be used to encourage teachers to locate in rural areas (UNESCO 1966). • The impact of financial incentives is often limited by the small scale of the additional payment and poor targeting. To be effective, incentives need to be significant in scale, carefully targeted to remote schools, and tied to remaining in the post. • Recruiting local people as teachers and providing ongoing support may help to address the deployment problem (World Bank 2008).
Gap Areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What mechanisms can be put in place to ensure that teacher professional development, recruitment and compensation are achieved in a participatory and transparent manner? • How can the private sector support the expansion of quality, relevant, and equitable education in PCPD context while still ensuring that the government remains the primary duty bearer? • How can governments and aid organizations create open channels of communication with teachers in rural areas in PCPD contexts in order to best monitor and support them? How has technology and distance learning been used effectively, particularly given the constraints of many PCPD contexts? 	

VII. Teacher Compensation

In fragile states, situations of displacement and post-crisis recovery, teachers are often underpaid or not paid at all. Non-payment of salaries can contribute to brain-drain from the teaching force, social unrest and to learning situations in which children are vulnerable to exploitation.

Teacher Compensation		
	Example	Policy/ Programming: Lessons Learned
Negative Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Insufficient Teacher Compensation</u> In Cambodia, the “grossly insufficient pay, working conditions, and social status accorded to the profession have left many disenchanted. Historically, aggrieved teachers have been a driving force for political change in the country.” (UNESCO 2011a) In a recent survey 93% of individual teachers interviewed held second jobs and 99% claimed that a teaching salary alone was not enough to survive. These activities, while vital to teachers’ livelihoods, pose a troubling risk to the integrity of the education system, especially since many teachers end up personally tutoring students from their own classes. Besides feeding broader patterns of corruption, this phenomenon further entrenches inequalities between the rich and poor (UNESCO 2011a).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Follow good practices outlined in the INEE Guidance Notes to Teacher Compensation to plan and implement an appropriate system for teacher compensation.
Positive Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Effective Teacher Compensation</u> UNHCR Malaysia found, through regular participatory assessments with teachers, parents, students and partners, that teacher compensation was an important way to address the gap in teacher support. As a result, UNHCR, with the help of its implementing partners, rolled out teacher compensation for over 100 refugee teachers in 2010, continuing into 2011. Once refugee teachers were compensated, mechanisms to ensure accountability were created including ToRs, Codes of Conduct (CoC) and monitoring tools. This program resulted in improved quality of instruction, a more positive reputation of teachers within their communities and teachers noted their renewed commitment to teaching (INEE 2011).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Successful teacher compensation for refugee teachers may depend heavily upon consultation and planning with relevant stakeholders i.e. partners and refugee teachers. Participatory process/feedback sessions are important and can be built into quarterly education coordination meetings. Such regular consultation may promote ownership of the initiative. Working closely with implementing partners responsible for teacher compensation on all aspects of teacher compensation and monitoring (INEE 2010b). UN agencies, donors or NGOs should not remain the primary source of funding for teachers in government schools for extended periods of time. Where education programmes are wholly supported by donors, NGOs or communities, actors should try to ensure that interventions are coordinated with existing policies and practices, are sustainable or have an exit strategy that is coordinated with other actors, especially the MoE (INEE 2009).
Gap Areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> How can the humanitarian community engage with the national government to ensure continued teacher compensation after the aid community leaves? How can governments and aid organizations best monitor compensation systems to avoid corruption and mismanagement? How have governments and aid organizations been able to successfully identify sustainable funding streams to provide adequate and long-term compensation for teachers? 	

VII. Instruction and Learning Process

The interaction between the learner and the teacher is the most vital part of the education process. In fragile PCPD situations it is imperative that instruction and learning processes address the needs of all learners by promoting inclusiveness and reducing barriers to learning. Learning environments that teach students to think critically and question their role in society may help contribute to an active democratic citizenry.

Instruction and Learning Processes		
	Example	Policy/ Programming: Lessons Learned
Negative Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Corporal Punishment</u> Schools reflect and reproduce violence outside the classroom by regularly exposing children to corporal punishment and schoolbooks extolling violence. (UNESCO 2011b) Although Afghanistan has enacted laws prohibiting corporal punishment in school, it is still a daily reality for many school students around the country. A vast majority of teachers continue to beat children and believe that physical punishment is an essential and unavoidable practice to maintain discipline in the school (Save the Children 2011).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduce corporal punishment and other forms of violence in school, including bullying, by teacher training, school-specific action plans and closer inspection of schools. • Introduce public education, awareness-raising and mobilisation campaigns on the harmful effects of corporal punishment with a view to changing the general attitude towards this practice and promote positive, non-violent, participatory forms of child-rearing and education as an alternative to corporal punishment (Committee on the Rights of the Child 2011). • Providing a platform for children to raise their concerns to the community can be a step towards ending violence in schools, however there is a need to involve multiple stakeholders such as youth, parents and community (Save the Children 2011).
Negative Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Hierarchical teacher-student relationships</u> In Cambodia, power dynamics of student-teacher relationships reflect and reinforce the hierarchical and authoritarian nature of Cambodian society. This relationship is complicit in corruption and in reinforcing the nation's 'tentative peace,' because students are not provided the opportunity to learn critical skills necessary to question their roles in society. Additionally, rote learning practices that are employed by such teacher-student relationships do not require students to question or think critically and therefore do not contribute to the creation of an active civil society or democratic citizenry. The failure to use teaching methods that develop critical and creative thinking skills is likely to significantly impact citizenry's ability to express its opinions, organize communities, exert political influence or counter manipulation (UNESCO 2011a).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A student-centred teaching approach is recommended. • Model best practices and learner-centred teaching in training programmes so that teachers internalize new dynamics. Provide opportunities for teachers to practice new skills and reflect on process and impact (INEE 2010a). • Reinforce concepts of real learner participation. Training, monitoring and evaluation of trainee teachers should focus on whether children are actively engaged in learning. Skills in questioning techniques are central to this (INEE 2010a). • Learner-centred, participatory methods may be integrated through a phased approach over time given the limits of teacher and training capacity in PCPD contexts.

Positive Impact on Fragility	<p><u>Gender bias</u> In Somaliland there is a tendency among male teachers to neglect girl pupils due to a negative attitude towards girls' education. Corporal punishment and physical abuse adds to girls' barrier to access their right to education. A lack of understanding of human rights issues among the teachers is reported to negatively affect the level of child protection, girls' enrolment and the ability to impart quality education. However, since the adoption of a teacher's CoC based on the INEE Minimum Standards in Somaliland, participating teachers have displayed eagerness to use participatory learning methodology, encourage girls' participation and identify alternatives to corporal punishment (INEE 2008).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education can promote respect for rights and non-violence through codes of conduct for teachers, as well as through peace education programs (UNESCO 2011b). • To create ownership of the CoC, teachers should be involved in the development of the document. • Training and monitoring of teachers by regional inspectors is key for the successful implementation of the CoC (INEE 2010b). • Education systems must be inclusive of all vulnerable populations including those with disabilities, HIV/AIDS, children associated with armed forces, ethnic/ linguistic minorities and teenage mothers.
Gap Areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a lack of qualitative and quantitative data on teaching and learning practices and outcomes in PCPD contexts. How practices such as rights-based teacher professional development and student-centred education training impact on fragility need to be further explored. 	

IX. Next Steps

- Share document with practitioners and academics to add input and set priorities for further research.
- Create programming and practical guidance for action related to teacher policy in fragile contexts.
- Support the implementation and use of the [INEE Guidance Notes on Teacher Compensation](#) and INEE Guidance Notes and Resource Pack on Teaching and Learning in PCPD contexts. Collect feedback and revise these inter-agency good practice tools as needed.
- Engage the new INEE Quality Education Task Team on Prevention, Preparedness, Response and Recovery and partners to advance gap areas in teacher policy as identified here.
- Develop clear conceptual frameworks on teacher policy in fragile contexts that collects the necessary information, best practices and identifies challenges.

Works Cited

- Committee on the Rights of the Child (2011) CRC/C/AFG/1 [Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Afghanistan](#).
- INEE (2008) [Minimum Standards Case Study: The Implementation of INEE Minimum Standards in Somaliland/ North West Somalia](#).
- INEE (2009) [Guidance Notes on Teacher Compensation in Fragile States, Situations of Displacement and Post-Crises Recovery](#).
- INEE (2010a) [Guidance Notes on Teaching and Learning](#).
- INEE (2010b) [Minimum Standards for Education: Preparedness, Response, Recovery](#).
- INEE (2010c) [Minimum Standards Case Study: Teacher Training- South Sudan, World Relief](#).
- INEE (2011) [Minimum Standards Case Study: Refugee Teacher Compensation in Malaysia](#).
- Magill, Clare (2010) [Education and Fragility in Bosnia and Herzegovina](#), UNESCO.
- Mulkeen, Aidan (2006) [Teachers for Rural Schools: A Challenge for Africa, Association for the Development of Education in Africa](#).
- OECD (2001) *Teachers for Tomorrow's Schools: Analysis of the World Education Indicators*.
- Save the Children Protection Initiative (2011) [Case Study: Violence free schools in Afghanistan](#).
- Shepler, Susan (2010) [Does Teacher Training for Refugees Contribute to Post-Conflict Reconstruction of Educational Systems? Evidence from West Africa](#), IRC.
- Sigsgaard, Morten, ed. (2011) [On the Road to Resiliency Capacity Development with the Ministry of Education in Afghanistan](#), UNESCO/ IIEP.
- UNESCO (1966) [ILO/ UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers](#).
- UNESCO (2010) [EFA Global Monitoring Report: Reaching the Marginalized](#).
- UNESCO (2011a) [Education and Fragility in Cambodia](#).
- UNESCO (2011b) [Understanding Education's Role in Fragility: Synthesis of Four Situational Analyses of Education and Fragility: Afghanistan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cambodia, Liberia](#).
- World Bank (2007) [Education in Sierra Leone: Present Challenges, Future opportunities, Africa Human Development Series](#).
- World Bank (2008) [Teachers for Rural Schools](#).